

Rubric for Coding Problem-Solving Analysis Protocol (P-SAP) (Revised from Eyler and Giles, 1999; Steinke and Fitch, 2003)

Problem Analysis Locus (1st question)

0	1	2	3	4	5	6
no problem analysis; does not view the issue as a problem; answer given does not address problems	problem defined in terms of individual mental state/individual behavior; focus of problem on individuals who may make up a group; if the group is mentioned the focus is on individual mental states, behaviors and characteristics of the individual group members	problem defined in terms of group of which individual is a member (e.g., family, nation, cultural group, occupation); focus of problem on group/shared characteristics; identifies subgroups that have different consequences; reference to characteristics of group of which the individual is a member	problem defined in terms of broader system (e.g., political, educational, financial, occupational); system identified but not developed/explained/elaborated; reference to characteristics of broader systems	problem defined in terms of broader system and further developed/explained/elaborated; both systemic and individual mentioned but not developed/explained/elaborated	problem defined in terms of both individuals and systems <i>and</i> developed/explained/elaborated; individual and systemic integrated but without clear causal connections	problem defined in terms of both individuals and systems with both developed/explained/elaborated <i>and</i> integrated <i>with</i> causal connections between the systemic and individual
e.g., “don’t know”; “to me, this is not a problem”	e.g., “all kids are parented differently”; “this will prohibit them from having fun, getting in shape and building confidence”; “people will naturally fight control”	e.g., “it causes people to develop stereotypes and prejudices about a certain group of people”; “people in America are becoming very unhealthy; “children spend a lot of their time with daycare providers”	e.g., “in other countries childcare is much more valued and the government pays for most of it”; “most companies still aren’t diversified at all levels”	e.g., “without an adequate childcare facility, children are at a disadvantage. A good quality daycare can sometimes overtake the problems of a disadvantaged home environment”; “people will be dying at a much earlier age and health insurance will be outrageous”	e.g., “it is difficult to know how many rights and responsibilities each student should have. Every student is different and it would be hard to be fair to everyone. Some students are more responsible than others.”	e.g., “students should be given freedom because they’re more likely to want to learn but the balance is difficult to find because some students will take the freedom to an extreme if given no responsibility”

Problem Analysis Complexity (1st question)

0	1	2	3
no problem analysis; does not view as a problem; answer given does not address problems	Low: simple; no context; one reason given even if that reason has two related parts (e.g., occupation as defined by both work and school, affects two sides of the same issue, affects development of social and cognitive); low elaboration of a single reason	Medium: more elaboration of single reason (e.g., statement about the cause or the consequence, or an example); at least two very different reasons identified but not elaborated with different reasons either representing two different perspectives or clear differences within the same perspective (e.g., both short-term and long-term, both individual and social); different reasons identified for different subgroups	High: at least two different reasons explained/elaborated and situated in context with causal connections either between or within the reasons; multiple perspectives developed/explained/elaborated
e.g., “don’t know”	e.g., “hard to find people you can trust and are reliable”; “there are many diseases and risk factors that go along with obesity”; “because everyone needs to work together and not just be told what to do”	e.g., “Because a lot of Americans don’t think they need to interact with other types of people. People are not being educated enough about other cultures”; “because their lack of skills and knowledge are greatly affecting their children who in turn will likely lack these skills and knowledge for their kids”	e.g., “Because there are more and more students with disabilities entering into the public school programs because the government wants them to be in the least restricted environment possible”

Causal Locus (2nd question)

0	1	2	3	4	5	6
no causal locus; does not identify a cause; does not think there is a cause; gives an answer that does not answer the question about cause	individual mental state, behavior or other characteristic of the individual even if not intentional (e.g., genetic endowment); focus is on <i>individual differences</i> among people in general or a specified group of people	individual focus with some placement within broader social group or system of which the individual is a member (e.g., family, nation, cultural group, occupation); reference is to the group of individuals/ <i>shared characteristics</i> of members of a group or situational factors that define a group; different groups may be contrasted or implied to make the point	systemic causal locus (e.g., political, educational, financial, occupational) identified but not developed/explained/elaborated	systemic locus identified with development/explanation/elaboration; explanation given for why the system causes a problem; greater specificity about what part of the system causes the problem or how the problem came to be; both systemic and individual mentioned but not developed/explained/elaborated	both individual and systemic locus developed/explained/elaborated; individual and systemic integrated but without clear causal connections	both individual and systemic locus developed/explained/elaborated <i>and</i> integrated <i>with</i> causal connections between the systemic and individual
e.g., “don’t know”; “I can’t really speak for others”	e.g., “Ignorance, need for power, selfishness”; “People have no self control”; “narrow-mindedness, not wanting to learn about people different from themselves”	e.g., “Managers don’t always help victims out, the victim is afraid to report it, tell themselves it was not a big deal or was victim’s fault”; “The fact that children are reared by their parents makes us think that they have the greatest influence, when in fact most children don’t even spend that much time with their parents during the day.”	e.g., “faculty aren’t trained properly for the needs of the special population”; “our educational system is rigid, defined and has established that student responsibility comes only when a teacher tells them what to do”	e.g., “Majority in management. Lack of minorities who are qualified”; “We don’t as a society place enough value on human services jobs like daycare providers or teachers. Bad economy, greedy daycare providers trying to get money for just “babysitting.”; “I think the view of society causes this problem. Many people see those problems as being normal occurrences. Others may say lack of discipline.”	e.g., “Many parents are selfish and try to make their kids into who they want them to be. Parents are sometimes unaware of the consequences this will have later on. Other people might think that values in society have taken a negative turn in parenting. They might say that so much is going on that parents aren’t taking the time to listen to their kids and are avoiding learning about being a good parent.”	e.g., “Teachers do not do a good enough job in teaching P.E. so the students can’t see any observable benefits that they can obtain from it. And society lets the people choose to be that way, they can sit around, be unhealthy and sick, and we will pay for it, so why should they change.”

Causal Complexity (2nd question)

0	1	2	3
no cause given; does not think there is a cause; response does not identify a cause; gives a response that does not answer the question about cause	Low: simple; no context; low elaboration of a single cause; two causes identified that are highly related to each other and not explained	Medium: more extensive elaboration of a single cause usually with causal connectivity; at least two very different causal loci identified	High: at least two causes identified and explained with causal connections within at least one of the explanations; causes representing multiple perspectives integrated with causal links
e.g., “don’t know”	“People would rather do things their own way, not be told how to do them.”; “Everyone is different.”; “If they can’t do a certain activity then they get frustrated and don’t want to try anymore.”	“People not caring could be a major factor. I also think that all the temptations of bad eating is in there too. Some of it is just in the family.”; “There is such a fine line between what a student should be able to do and what not. Many parents allow children to do things at home that they aren’t supposed to do at school.”	“Being a good childcare provider is not a glorious job and doesn’t pay much, so not as many people seek out to do it. So then it’s not quality, but since there’s little competition, they can jack up their price.”

Solution Locus (3rd question)

0	1	2	3	4	5	6
no solution locus; does not feel a solution is needed; gives an answer that does not answer the question	solution focused on individual mental state/individual behavior/individual differences in how people respond to situations	solution focused on individuals as members of a social group (e.g., family, nation, cultural group, occupation) but not connected to an established system; focus is on the group as a whole; different groups may be contrasted to make the point or the reader can easily generate groups that could be contrasted	systemic solution (e.g., political, educational, financial, occupational) identified but not well developed/explained/elaborated; solution focused on changing, expanding, or pointing out what is right or wrong with an established system	systemic solution developed/explained/elaborated; reference to broader principle (e.g. reciprocity; equity); explanation as to why or how the system should be changed or expanded; both systemic and individual mentioned but not developed/explained/elaborated	both individual and systemic solution developed/explained/elaborated; individual and systemic integrated but without clear causal connections	both individual and systemic solution developed/explained/elaborated <i>and</i> integrated <i>with</i> causal connections between the systemic and individual
e.g., “don’t know”	e.g., “People need to accept other people for who they are, not for who they aren’t. They think people who are different from them need to adapt instead of adapting themselves.”	e.g., “I think students without disabilities need to put themselves in the shoes of someone with disabilities so they can somewhat know what it is like to live everyday of your life with a disability.”	e.g., “Inform employees about policies through writing and reinforce them through action.”; “I think we should look at some of the European strategies and adopt those that seem to be working for them. Also, offer better benefits and incentives to potential caregivers.”	e.g., “More affordable daycares, daycares where people work, have one parent stay at home to watch the kids.”; “Quarterly checkups along with a good diet, find cures or medication that will greatly reduce it.”	e.g., “I think that more parenting issues need to be addressed earlier-in H.S. classes. It is information that can be applied to any relationship, esp. learning how to be active listeners for children. Sometimes people think that nothing should be done because being a parent is assumed knowledge.”	e.g., “Teach people how to lead organizations in a way that values the contributions of each member and makes others want to follow them. Get everyone’s input and develop a plan for everyone to work together. When people feel valued by the organization they are more likely to commit to it.”

Solution Complexity (3rd question)

0	1	2	3
no solution locus; does not feel a solution is needed; gives an answer that does not answer the question	Low: naïve; no context; often individual action without analysis; unconnected to current service infrastructure; low elaboration of a single solution	Medium: some context and recognition of need to gather more information; some awareness of current efforts with mention of how solution is connected to a current program or service infrastructure with reference to established sites (e.g., hospitals, schools) or direct reference to recognized professions at established sites (e.g., nurses, teachers); cites current program as model; at least two very different solutions offered	High: systemic approach connected to causes and needs assessment; multiple solutions or complex solutions that are developed/explained/elaborated
e.g., “don’t know”	e.g., “Have the people exercise more and do it with a partner.”; “Encourage people to be open and honest about everything in the workplace.”	e.g., “legislation and government funding for daycare, educate the general population about benefits of high quality daycare and what they can do to ensure their kids get it, lower the cost”; “mentoring programs, more open minded people, affirmative action”	e.g., “I think that teachers need to be sure to look at each child’s IEP and create activities that they are sure each student can do. Teachers need to set their students up for success. Some may believe disabled children need to be separated from the class and some may not see the importance of PE for these children.”

Solution Analysis Locus (4th question)

0	1	2	3	4	5	6
no solution analysis; does not think there are strengths or limitations; answer given does not address strengths or limitations	strengths or limitations of solution analyzed in terms of individual mental state/individual behavior; focus of strengths or limitations on individuals who may make up a group; if the group is mentioned the focus is on individual mental states, behaviors and characteristics of the individual group members	strengths or limitations of solution analyzed in terms of group of which individual is a member (e.g., family, nation, cultural group, occupation); focus of strengths or limitations on group/shared characteristics; identifies subgroups that have different consequences; reference to characteristics of group of which the individual is a member	strengths or limitations of solution analyzed in terms of broader system (e.g., political, educational, financial, occupational); system identified but not developed/explained/elaborated; reference to characteristics of broader systems	strengths or limitations of solution analyzed in terms of broader system and further developed/explained/elaborated; both systemic and individual mentioned but not developed/explained/elaborated	strengths or limitations of solution analyzed in terms of individuals and systems with both developed/explained/elaborated; individual and systemic integrated but without clear causal connections	strengths or limitations of solution analyzed in terms of both individuals and systems <i>and</i> developed/explained/elaborated <i>with</i> causal connections between the systemic and individual
e.g., “don’t know”; “I don’t see any limitations to my proposed solution to this problem”; “There aren’t any strengths or limitations”	e.g., “lack of intrinsic motivation”; “Some people just don’t care enough about their health to stick with it”; “More children will succeed and have a better understanding of what they are learning”	e.g., “You don’t know the background and history of those who are less informed. Their beliefs and values may stem from what their parents and other family members believe.”	e.g., “Many schools would not see it fit to teach subject material about parenting to H.S. students”; “It will promote more creative teaching and learning”	e.g., “money, time, qualified instructors and dropouts and/or kids who become pregnant in H.S.”; “It is hard to find available times to workout and create a healthy diet. Healthier food places tend to be more expensive.”	e.g., “It is difficult for people to grasp the idea that the nurture assumption has its flaws. This is the theory that our society values and we have all grown up believing it.”	e.g., “The family is considered a ‘sacred institution’ in our culture and one not to be messed with. As a result, even for those who are willing to acknowledge that many families are not functioning well, there is great reluctance to give up on the idealized model represented. People are reluctant to change.”

Solution Analysis Complexity (4th question)

0	1	2	3
no solution analysis; does not think there are strengths or limitations; answer given does not address strengths or limitations	Low: simple; no context; low elaboration of a single strength or limitation; more than one strength and/or limitation identified that are highly related to each other and not explained	Medium: more elaboration of single strength or limitation; at least two very different strengths and/or limitations identified either representing two different perspectives or clear differences within the same perspective (e.g., both short-term and long-term, both individual and social); different strengths or limitations identified for different subgroups	High: at least two strengths or limitations from the same perspective developed/explained/elaborated and situated in context with causal connections either between or within the strengths and/or limitations; multiple perspectives developed/explained/elaborated
e.g., “don’t know”; “There are going to be strengths and limitations to anything we do in life, but we have to figure out what works best for us and run with it. There will always be setbacks, but we have to get up and keep moving”	e.g., “A lot of people don’t like change.”; “People are reluctant to go and interact with people of special needs.”	e.g., “costs money to build daycares, takes time to find quality workers”	e.g., “By testing more frequently, students will be more used to them. It would also give a more accurate measure of student success. They have to be sure though not to test too often because students need to spend most of their time learning- not testing.”

Notes:

- . missing data/leaves the response blank (use even if they have answered other questions in the same protocol)
- A response needs to clearly satisfy *at least one* of the criteria listed to be assigned that particular code.
- If multiple codes are identified within one response, the highest code will determine the code for that response, unless both an individual and systemic are mentioned, qualifying the response as a “4” or the individual and systemic elements are connected in a way that meets the criteria for coding the entire response as a “5” or “6.”
- If part of the issue statement is repeated in the answer, do not code that part.
- Do not code statements that do not address the question.
- If so little context is given that the meaning is unclear, code at the lower level.